DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 437 582 CE 079 678

AUTHOR Fletcher, Jane; Gray, Dorothy
TITLE Follow-Up Report on the Enterprise Florida Jobs and Education Partnership.
INSTITUTION Florida State Legislature, Tallahassee. Office of Program Policy Analysis and Government Accountability.
REPORT NO FL-Pub-98-03
PUB DATE 1998-07-00
NOTE 6p.; For the 1995 status report, see ED 425 358.
AVAILABLE FROM Office of Program Policy Analysis and Government Accountability, 111 W. Madison, Tallahassee, FL 32399-1475. Tel: 800-531-2477 (Toll Free); Fax: 850-487-3804; e-mail: oppaga@mail.oppaga.state.fl.us. For full text: http://www.oppaga.state.fl.us/reports/econ/r98-03s/html.
PUB TYPE Legal/Legislative/Regulatory Materials (090) -- Reports - Evaluative (142)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Community Colleges; Disadvantaged Youth; Educational Legislation; *Employment Programs; Government School Relationship; Incentives; *Job Training; *Labor Force Development; Partnerships in Education; *Performance Based Assessment; Postsecondary Education; Program Effectiveness; Program Evaluation; School Business Relationship; Secondary Education; State Legislation; *State Programs; Statewide Planning; *Welfare Services
IDENTIFIERS Florida

ABSTRACT

The Enterprise Florida Jobs and Education Partnership has taken actions to resolve issues raised in a previous report. The legislature has expanded the partnership's work force development (WFD) role; assigned it a role in implementing the state's welfare-to-work program; and established additional incentive funding for WFD program outcomes. The partnership has expanded its evaluation efforts to address requirements in recent legislation. It has developed both baseline measures necessary to determine whether performance outcomes are improving from year to year, as well as expected performance levels necessary to evaluate whether WFD programs are achieving desired outcomes. The partnership's procedures for identifying and eliminating poor performing programs include evaluating the performance of local WFD boards and requiring corrective action when appropriate. Local WFD boards refer clients to community college and school district job training programs. The partnership uses Performance-Based Incentive Funding (PBIF) to encourage community colleges and school districts to provide job training programs that prepare individuals for occupations that meet market demands and provide a living wage. Disadvantaged student outcomes (completion, employment rates, wage levels) show substantial increases since the PBIF program began. The partnership monitors community college and school district PBIF performance to prevent loss of federal funds. (YLB)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 437 582

Follow-up Report on the Enterprise Florida Jobs and Education Partnership Report No. 98-03

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

K Hutchens

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

ED 079 678

THE FLORIDA LEGISLATURE

Report No. 98-03

Office of
Program Policy Analysis
And Government Accountability

John W. Turcotte, Director

July 1998

Follow-Up Report on the Enterprise Florida Jobs and Education Partnership

Abstract

- The Enterprise Florida Jobs and Education Partnership (the Partnership) has taken actions in response to the issues in our earlier report. The Partnership developed baseline measures that are necessary to determine if performance outcomes are improving from year to year. The Partnership also developed expected performance levels that are necessary to evaluate whether workforce development programs are achieving desired outcomes.

- The Partnership's procedures for identifying and eliminating poor performing programs includes evaluating the performance of local workforce development boards and requiring corrective action when appropriate. Local workforce development boards refer clients to community college and school district job training programs. The Partnership uses BPIF (Performance-Based Incentive Funding) to encourage community colleges and school districts to provide job training programs that prepare individuals for occupations that meet market demands and provide a living wage. The Partnership does not have a mechanism for requiring that community colleges and school districts discontinue poor performing programs. The Partnership has not resolved the issue of consistent outcome measures for workforce development programs.

- Disadvantaged student outcomes (completion, employment rates, and wage levels) show substantial increases since the PBIF program began in Fiscal Year 1994-95. The Partnership monitors community college and school district PBIF performance to prevent loss of federal funds.

Purpose

In accordance with s. 11.45(7)(f), F.S., this follow-up report informs the Legislature of actions taken by the Enterprise Florida Jobs and Education Partnership (the Partnership) in response to our Report No. 95-16, which we issued December 19, 1995. This report presents our assessment of the extent to which the Jobs and Education Partnership (also known as the Workforce Development Board) has addressed the findings and recommendations included in our report.

Background

Enterprise Florida, Inc, focuses on creating higher-paying jobs through technology innovation and capital formation. The Legislature established the Partnership in 1994 as an affiliate of Enterprise Florida, Inc. The Partnership is a 30-member board with a staff of 18 located in Tallahassee. The purpose of the Partnership is to create and maintain a highly skilled workforce able to respond to rapidly changing technology and market opportunities essential to a competitive Florida economy.

In 1994, the Legislature also created the High Skills/High Wage initiative through the Performance-Based Incentive Funding (PBIF) program for community colleges and school districts that prepare students for high-demand, high-wage jobs as identified by the Occupational Forecasting Conference[1]. The Partnership distributed $19.4 million in PBIF

[1] The Occupational Forecasting Conference consists of representatives from the Department of Education, Department of Labor and Employment Security, the Governor's Office of Tourism, Trade, and Economic Development, and the Division of Economic and Demographic Research of the Joint Legislative Management Committee of the Florida Legislature. Florida has several of these consensus-type conferences that are established in law. For example, there is an Economic Forecasting Conference and a Public School Enrollment Forecasting Conference. The conferees meet periodically to develop consensus on projections which then become official data from which state agencies, the legislature and other interests will work. The Occupational Forecasting Conference conferees consider forecasts of job openings, employment, program placements, and earnings in reaching consensus on determining high demand, high wage occupations.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

incentives for performance in Fiscal Years 1994-95 and 1995-96.[2]

The Partnership charters local workforce development boards to coordinate workforce programs in local districts throughout the state. In Fiscal Year 1997-98, the Board received a $1.2 million appropriation for coordination and administration of workforce development in Florida. The Legislature appropriated $26 million for two workforce development programs administer by the Partnership. The Quick Response Training Program received $4 million in general revenue and the PBIF program received $22 million from the following sources:

- $2 million from community colleges,
- $4 million from school districts,
- $6 million from Project Independence, and
- $10 from federal Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA), Title III, funds that Florida receives for providing job training serves to workers displaced by a permanent closing or substantial layoffs within a business.[3]

Prior Findings

The Partnership had adopted a research design with outcome measures for three of its six statutory goals, but to more effectively evaluate performance outcomes, needed to

- develop additional outcome measures with baselines and expected performance levels for all outcome measures,
- coordinate with the Florida Education and Training Placement Information Program (FETPIP) and agencies that administer workforce development programs to improve its system for evaluating the state's workforce development efforts.
- provide a mechanism for evaluating major employment training programs and eliminating poor performing programs; and
- develop consistent performance measures for valid comparisons of outcomes across programs.

When we conducted our analysis in 1995, preliminary data indicated the Partnership's PBIF program was producing some positive short-term results. Student outcomes (completion, employment rate, and salary levels) improved for programs that received PBIF incentives.

In Fiscal Year 1994-95, the first year of its operation, the PBIF Program failed to expend a portion the JTPA Title III funds allocated for performance incentives. Consequently, the U.S. Department of Labor reduced Florida's JTPA, Title III, funding by $3.8 million in 1995-96. We recommended the Partnership develop a monitoring system to ensure that PBIF funds are used for maximum benefit.

Current Status

The Legislature and the Jobs and Education Partnership have taken actions to address the issues in our prior report. The Legislature expanded the Partnership's workforce development role and assigned the Partnership a role in implementing the state's welfare-to-work program. The Legislature established additional incentive programs for workforce development programs outcomes such as completion and job placement. The Partnership expanded its evaluation efforts to address requirements in recent legislation and issues raised in our report.

Legislative Actions

Workforce Development. In the Workforce Florida Act of 1996, the Legislature expanded the Jobs and Education Partnership's workforce development role. The Act assigned the Partnership the role of Florida's State Human Resource Investment Council. The Council is responsible for coordinating federal Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA) programs. The Partnership is responsible for granting charters to regional workforce development boards with membership consistent with federal and state law. According to the Act, the regional workforce development boards must provide the following initiatives:

- **School-to-Work** provides career development and job preparation skills for public school students.
- **Welfare-to-Work** encourages self-sufficiency for welfare recipients. In October 1996, the Work and Gain Economic Self-sufficiency (WAGES) Act program became the primary mechanism for implementing this initiative.
- **High Skills/High Wage** identifies the availability of high wage jobs and provides incentives to state job training programs that prepare individuals for these jobs. Jobs are identified through the Occupational Forecasting.

---

[2] As of April 1998, the Partnership had awarded $8.1 million PBIF incentives for Fiscal Year 1996-97 performance. The Partnership has not yet completed the calculations of all PBIF incentives awarded for Fiscal Year 1996-97 performance outcomes.

[3] JTPA, Title III, funds allocated for PBIF incentives must be used to serve displaced workers, and BPIF incentive claims have not been sufficient to use all the Title III funds. To prevent loss of federal funding, the Partnership monitors PBIF incentive payments and reallocates unexpended PBIF Title III funds to support local JTPA projects that serve displaced workers.

- **One-Stop Career Centers** provide clients with information about the full range of services available from the state (e.g., unemployment benefits, job placement, job training) in a single visit.

The Act requires the Partnership establish measures and standards to evaluate workforce development strategies. (See Exhibit 1.)

Multiple Incentives Now Available. The Legislature uses incentive to tie funding to program outcomes to encourage programs to produce the desired outcomes. The Legislature's first effort to tie funding to workforce development program outcomes was through PBIF. The PBIF program began providing incentive funds for workforce development outcomes in Fiscal Year 1994-95. In Fiscal Year 1996-97, the Legislature made additional incentives funds available through Performance-Based Program Budgeting (PB^2). Under PB^2, the Legislature appropriated $12 million in 1996-97 and $12 million in 1997-98 to provide incentives to community colleges for workforce development outcomes such as program completion and job placement.

The Legislature Created Workforce Development Education Fund. The Legislature created a third incentive fund in Ch.97-307, Laws of Florida. The Workforce Development Education Fund links program funding to performance outcomes. Student enrollments determine initial funding levels. Community colleges and school districts earn additional funds for such as program completion and job placement. The Legislature scheduled implementation for July 1, 1998, and created a task force to identify any barriers to implementation student outcomes.

Better Information Necessary to Link Finding to Performance. In the Workforce Development Implementation Act of 1998, the Legislature found that the performance-based funding required by Ch. 9707, Laws of Florida, cannot be implemented using current information available on workforce development program outcomes. The 1998 Act requires the Department of Education, community colleges, and school districts to develop a Workforce Development Information System during Fiscal Year 1998-99. The act establishes July 1, 1999, as the revised implementation date for allocating funds for workforce programs through the Workforce Development Education Fund.

Exhibit 1
The Partnership Is Developing Tier 1 and Tier 2 Performance Measures
As Required by the Workforce Development Act

Tier	Performance Measures
Tier 1 Systemwide Outcomes	• Employment in occupations demonstrating continued growth in wages; • Continued Employment after 3, 6, 12, and 24 months; • Reduction in and elimination of public assistance reliance; • Employer satisfaction; and • Positive return on investment of public resources.
Tier 2 Impact of Major Initiatives	A set of standards and measures for each of the four initiatives (School-to-Work, Welfare-to-Work, High Skills/High Wage, and One-Stop Career Centers) shall include: 1. Job placement rate, 2. Cost per entered employment, 3. Earnings at placement, 4. Employment retention, and 5. Entered employment rate. These initiatives may add measures as follows: • **School-to-Work** Number of students enrolling and completing work-based programs. • **Welfare-to-Work** 1. Reduction in and elimination of public assistance reliance, and 2. Savings resulting from reduced reliance on public assistance. • **One-Stop Career Centers** 1. Placement at minimum wage 2. Placement at wage level established by Occupational Forecasting Conference 3. Placement at wage level above that established by the Conference
Tier 3 Operational Measures	May be developed by implementing agencies and may be specific to federal requirements and should reflect regional differences such as job availability, unemployment rate, average wages, and availal employment population.

Source: Section 288.9620, F.S.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Jobs and Education Partnership Actions

As required by the Workforce Florida Act of 1996, the Partnership developed performance measures for evaluating the state's workforce development efforts. The Partnership's 1997 performance measures include baselines and expected performance levels for performance outcomes as recommended in our report.

The Partnership's procedures for identifying and eliminating poor performing programs includes evaluating annual performance of regional workforce development boards, issuing annual performance reports, and requesting corrective action based on regional boards' annual performance. The Partnership relies upon PBIF to encourage boards to refer clients to programs with good performance and discourage referrals to poor performing programs, such as cosmetology.

Performance outcomes such as program completion are still defined differently among workforce development programs. Consequently, valid comparison of program performance can only be made within similar programs. The Partnership is working with workforce development agencies to develop consistency in defining program outcomes.

The Partnership's PBIF outcome data shows positive results. Completion and job placement rates increased substantially for designated students since the PBIF program began in Fiscal Year 1993-94. (See Exhibit 2.)

The state has not lost any additional federal funds due unexpended PBIF funds. The Partnership works with the Department of Labor and Employment Security and the Office of Tourism, Trade and Economic Development to update federal JTPA expenditure projections throughout the year. The Partnership makes adjustments to prevent reductions in the state's JTPA allocations. In Fiscal Year 1996-97, the Partnership distributed $1.7 million in unexpended funds to regional workforce development boards to assist with WAGES efforts.

Exhibit 2

PBIF Outcomes[1]

Performance Category	Baseline 1992-93	Year 1 1994-95	Year 2 1995-96	Change 1992-95
All Students				
Completions	17,472	18,709	24,256	39%
Completers Placed	10,213	14,473	16,851	65%
Leavers Placed[2]	4,963	13,732	14,796	
Designated Populations[3]				
Enrollments	25,587	42,138	48,930	91%
Completions	4,886	6,136	8,089	66%
Completers Placed	2,118	4,223	5,077	140%
Leavers Placed	1,223	4,736	3,089	153%

[1]Outcomes are not yet available for Fiscal Year 1996-97.

[2]Leavers are individuals who leave structured training programs prior to completion and subsequently gain employment in the high wage occupations identified through the Occupational Forecasting Conference.

[3]Designated populations are economically disadvantaged individuals, individuals with disabilities, the limited English proficient, and workers who have been dislocated from their jobs.

Source: Enterprise Florida Workforce Development Board

Observation

The Legislature may want to consider the impact of providing multiple incentive funding programs for workforce development programs. Multiple incentives for the similar outcomes may create conflicting goals for community colleges and school districts. The PBIF program rewards job-training programs for preparing students for high demand occupations identified in the Occupational Forecasting Conference. PB^2 funding provides incentives for all workforce development outcomes regardless of whether the training is in a high demand occupation. The Workforce Development Fund will provide incentives similar to those provided by the PB^2 funding. Consequently, job training programs will have to choose between conflicting goals of multiple incentive programs in providing workforce development programs. Job training programs also have additional reporting requirements and more complexity in the budgeting process with multiple incentive programs

OPPAGA provides objective, independent, professional analyses of state policies and services to assist the Florida Legislature in decision-making, to ensure government accountability, and to recommend the best use of public resources. This project was conducted in accordance with applicable evaluation standards. Copies of this report in print or alternate accessible format may be obtained by telephone (850/488-0021 or 800/531-2477), by FAX (850/4873804), in person (Claude Pepper Building, Room312, 111 W. Madison St.), or by mail (OPPAGA Report Production, P.O. Box 1735, Tallahassee, FL 32302).

Web site: http://www.oppaga.state.fl.us

Project supervised by: Jane Fletcher (850/487-9255) Project conducted by: Dorothy N. Gray (850/487-9277)

BEST COPY AVAILABLE